

⌘ Modern Logic Publishing ⌘

Publishers of
Modern Logic

An International Journal of the History of Mathematical Logic, Set Theory, and
Foundations of Mathematics
and
Modern Logic Books

19 June 1992

Prof. William J. Rapaport
Department of Computer Science
SUNY Buffalo
Buffalo, NY 14260

Dear Professor Rapaport,

This is in reply to your query for a Hilbert/Frege reference.

The original reference to Hilbert's remark that "One must be able to say at all times - instead of points, straight lines, and planes - tables, chairs, and beer mugs" is in Otto Blumenthal's biography of Hilbert, first published in *Natur-wissenschaften* 10 (1922), 65-104, and is reprinted in vol. III of Hilbert's *Gesammelte Abhandlungen* (Springer, 2nd ed., 1970), 388-429, where you will find the quote, cited as an off-the-cuff remark by Hilbert, on p. 403. It is repeated in C. Reid in her book *Hilbert-Courant* (Springer, 1986, p. 57), and by J. Fang in his book *Hilbert* (Paideia Press, 1970, p. 81).

Frege's responses to Hilbert's work on geometry (and on axiomatics generally), including selections from the Frege-Hilbert correspondence, is found in Frege (E.-H. W. Kluge, transl.), *On the Foundations of Geometry and Formal Theories of Arithmetic* (Yale U. Press, 1971). Selections from the Frege-Hilbert correspondence are also found in Frege, *Philosophical and Mathematical Correspondence* (U. Chicago Press, 1980).

There is a mountain of philosophical writing on the "Frege-Hilbert controversy"; an older but respected treatment is a paper by that title in the journal *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 34 (1973-74), 386-403 by Michael Resnik. The best recent treatment of Hilbert is Volker Peckhaus's book *Hilbertprogramme und Kritische Philosophie* (Göttingen, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1990). The bibliographies in Peckhaus's book and in Resnik's book *Frege and the Philosophy of Mathematics* (Cornell U. Press, 1980) should guide you well to additional sources.

I hope this may be of some use to you and go at least part of the way to answering your question.

Sincerely yours,

Irving H. Anellis

Dr. Irving H. Anellis, Editor/Publisher
Henry Kormin, Executive Administrator
Modern Logic Publishing

Box 1036, Welch Avenue Station, Ames, IA 50010-1036, USA

☎ tel. 515/292-7499

e-mail - Bitnet: f1.mlp@ISUMVS; Internet: f1.mlp@ISUMVS.IASTATE.EDU