

Top Hat # 7592

Let $L = \{a^i b^j : i+j \text{ is even}\}$. Defaults: $i, j \geq 0$ so ϵ is in L .
Suppose we try to prove L is not regular. RED = errors.

"Take $S = a^*$, clearly infinite. Let any $x, y \in S, x \neq y$ be given. Then we can write $x = a^m, y = a^n$ where $n = m+1$. Take $z = bb$. Then $xz = a^m b^2$ and $yz = a^n b^2$. Then $m+2$ is even $\Leftrightarrow n+2$ is odd since $n = m+1$, so $L(xz) \neq L(yz)$. So S is PD for L, \dots etc.

ERROR: (x, y) is not a general choice of a pair from S .
"where n is $m+1$ different parity from m " is the same error.

Try #2: Take $S = (aa)^*$. Also clearly infinite.

Let any $x, y \in S, x \neq y$, be given. Then $x = a^m, y = a^n$ where m and n are both even and $n \neq m$. Take $z = ______$?? Not possible to get $L(xz) \neq L(yz)$.

In fact, all strings in S are equivalent w.r. to L .
with respect

We did get some information from the first try: $a^{m+1} \not\sim a^m$ for all m .

Let's put ϵ and a into our S representing the "m even" and "m odd" cases. Any more? Consider $x' = b$. Now $b \notin L$ and $\epsilon \in L$ so $b \not\sim \epsilon$, but is $b \sim a$?

$L = \{a^i b^j : i+j \text{ is even}\}$, so $ba \notin L$ while $aa \in L$. So $b \not\sim a$ via $z = a$.

S now = $\{\epsilon, a, b\}$.

Is that all? Ah, ba must go to a dead state distinct from the others since none of ϵ, a, b is dead w.r. to L .

Since we do feel that L is regular, we can use S to help design a DFA. All strings in S must go to different states. Now we have 4 states. Do we need any more? Is $aa \sim \epsilon$?

Yes, so $\delta(q_a, a) = s$ is fine. What about ab ? It is in L . But $ab \not\sim \epsilon$ by $z = a$. And ab is distinctive from all the other elements of S which are in L . Is $bb \sim a$?



Yes. M is done so S is done

Full Statement of MNT: A language L is regular \Leftrightarrow all PD sets for L are finite. When so, there is a maximum size m of a PD set, and m is the minimum size of a DFA M s.t. $L(M) = L$, and that M is unique of that size. Proof not given.

Defⁿ: • A state q is equivalent to itself. (in a DFA M)
 • Two states p and q are equivalent if they are both accepting or both rejecting, and for all $c \in \Sigma$, the states $p' = \delta(p, c)$ and $q' = \delta(q, c)$ are equivalent.

Is this definition circular? Yes. but for our purposes it is OK.
Inequivalence, based on $p \not\sim q$ if $p \in F \wedge q \notin F$ ~~and~~ vice-versa, is not circular.
 [That is the basis for an algorithm for minimizing DFAs, but it is not on our syllabus.]

More MNT Examples: $L_{\$d} = \{x \in \{\$, d\}^* : x \text{ is a survivable dungeon when you may hold any \# of spears \$}\}$

Prove that $L_{\$d}$ is not regular: Take $S = \{\$^m\}$. Clearly S is infinite. Let any $x, y \in S$, $x \neq y$ be given. Then there are $m, n \geq 0$ such that $x = \m , $y = \n , and wlog $m < n$. Take $z = d^n$. Then $xz = \$^m d^n \notin L_{\$d}$ because $m < n$ so the player gets killed by the $m+1$ st dragon. But $yz = \$^n d^n \in L_{\$d}$. Thus $L_{\$d}(xz) \neq L_{\$d}(yz)$, and since $x, y \in S$ are arbitrary, S is an infinite PD set for $L_{\$d}$.

What this also means is that in versions where the player may hold up to K spears, a DFA needs separate states for $\$, \$\$, \$\$\$, \$\$\$, \dots, \K . Plus the dead state makes $K+2$ states, and this is the minimum m .

Abstract Example: Define $L_K = \{x \in \{0, 1\}^* : |x| \geq K \text{ and the } K\text{th bit from right is } 1\}$. NFA for L_K has $K+1$ states. How many states does a DFA M need? $m = 2^K$ states.

Claim: $S = \{0, 1\}^K$ is a PD set for L_K , of size 2^K , so that many states are needed. Let any $x, y \in S$, $x \neq y$ be given. Because $x \neq y$, there is a bit place i s.t. $x_i \neq y_i$. Number from 0
 Take $z = 0^i$. wlog suppose " x " is the string such that $x_i = 1$, $y_i = 0$. Then xz has a 1 in i th from right place, but yz has a 0 there. So $yz \notin L_K$, $xz \in L_K$. Since x, y are arbitrary, S is a PD set for L_K .